

LADOTD Consultant Rating Rankings

July 21, 2017 Advertisement - Region 1

Retainer Contracts for Right of Way Appraisal Services

Contract No. 40000055, 40000056, 40000057, 40000058, 40000059, AND 40000060

Firm Name	Rating	Rank
David W. Volentine, MAI	72.40	1
Robinson Appraisal Services, LLC	71.51	2
Michael A. Graham	71.28	3
James I. Brantly	70.88	4
Todd Tidwell Appraisals & Consulting, LLC	69.87	5
H. David Gullette Jr., MAI	67.67	6
Wilbanks Appraisal Company	66.51	7
JDM Services, Inc.	65.77	8
Faith Roper Constant Appraisals, LLC	62.99	9
Bruce Britt Real Estate	62.10	10
Aguilar Consultants, LLC	54.58	11
The Pauley Corporation	53.64	12
Brian David Simoneaux Enterprises, Inc.	52.04	13
Murphy Appraisal Services, LLC	48.17	14
CBRE, Inc.	46.38	15

Consultant	Firm average Score (CPPR Database)*	Consultant past performance on DOTD Real Estate projects (0-4) (weight of 6)	Open Contract Amount (workload)	points for workload (0-4)	Consultant current workload with DOTD (weight of 1)	Average Score Firm Experience (0-4)	Consultant Firm Experience as related to the project (weight of 3)	Average Score Personnel Experience (0-4)	Consultant personnel experience as related to the project (weight of 4)	Average Score Firm Size (0-4)	Consultant firm size as related to the project magnitude (weight of 3)	points for distance (0-4)	Location where work will be performed (weight of 4)	Grand Totals
1 Aguilar Consultants, LLC	2.67	16.03	N/A	3.00	3.00	2.85	8.55	3.30	13.18	3.00	9.00	1.21	4.82	54.58
2 Brian David Simoneaux Enterprises, Inc.	2.53	15.15	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.10	9.30	2.90	11.60	3.00	9.00	1.00	3.99	52.04
3 Bruce Britt Real Estate	2.42	14.52	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.90	11.70	3.49	13.96	3.00	9.00	2.48	9.92	62.10
4 CBRE, Inc.	2.61	15.65	N/A	3.00	3.00	2.10	6.30	1.78	7.12	3.00	9.00	1.33	5.31	46.38
5 David W. Volentine, MAI	3.13	18.75	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.75	11.25	3.60	14.40	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	72.40
6 Faith Roper Constant Appraisals, LLC	2.61	15.65	N/A	3.00	3.00	2.90	8.70	2.66	10.64	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	62.99
7 H. David Gullette Jr., MAI	2.61	15.65	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.90	11.70	3.08	12.32	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	67.67
8 James I. Brantly	2.83	17.00	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.80	11.40	3.62	14.48	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	70.88
9 JDM Services, Inc.	2.71	16.25	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.90	11.70	3.51	14.04	3.00	9.00	2.94	11.78	65.77
10 Michael A. Graham	3.03	18.15	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.65	10.95	3.55	14.18	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	71.28
11 Murphy Appraisal Services, LLC	2.72	16.33	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.20	9.60	2.56	10.24	3.00	9.00	0.00	0.00	48.17
12 Robinson Appraisal Services, LLC	3.03	18.15	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.80	11.40	3.49	13.96	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	71.51
13 The Pauley Corporation	2.51	15.09	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.00	9.00	3.19	12.76	3.00	9.00	1.20	4.79	53.64
14 Todd Tidwell Appraisals & Consulting, LLC	3.00	18.00	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.85	11.55	3.08	12.32	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	69.87
15 Wilbanks Appraisal Company	2.39	14.33	N/A	3.00	3.00	3.90	11.70	3.12	12.48	3.00	9.00	4.00	16.00	66.51

Note: The scores which are shown to two decimal places in this table have not been rounded. The numbers are shown to two decimal places for convenience so the table can be printed on 8 1/2" x 11" paper. The actual values may vary by as much as +/- 0.005.

*The advertisement stated that each firm would receive a rating for each criteria using a scale of 0-4. However, the CPPR ratings were scored using the current scale, which is a rating scale from 1-5. In order to comport with the advertisement, the CPPR ratings were transferred from 1-5 to the 0-4 scale by subtracting 1. No other adjustments were made.